

Friday, 22 April 2016

Weekly Construction Law Review Selected from our Daily Bulletins covering Construction

 Follow @Benchmark_Legal

Search Engine

[Click here](#) to access our search engine facility to search legal issues, case names, courts and judges. Simply type in a keyword or phrase and all relevant cases that we have reported in Benchmark since its inception in June 2007 will be available with links to each case.

Executive Summary (1 minute read)

Botany Bay City Council v Minister for Local Government (NSWCA) - judicial review - dismissal of summons seeking relief in relation to Government proposal for appellant's merger with Council - appeal dismissed

Murray v Sheldon Commercial Interiors Pty Ltd (NSWCA) - negligence - slip and fall from ladder at work - causation not established - erroneous finding of breach of duty - appeal dismissed

Fistar v Riverwood Legion and Community Club Ltd (NSWCA) - equity - fraud - club and appellant were both victims of fraudster - club could not recover amount from appellant - appeal allowed

Palermo Seafoods Pty Ltd v Lunapas Pty Ltd (NSWCA) - pleadings - leases and tenancies - failure to address case pleaded by appellant - substantial miscarriage of justice - new trial - appeal allowed

Richtoll Pty Ltd v WW Lawyers (in Liquidation) Pty Ltd (NSWSC) - professional negligence - contract - solicitors' duties - failure to conduct further ASIC search just before draw down of loan was breach of duty/retainer - causation not established

Laratae v Dean's Pty Ltd (VSCA) - accident compensation - issue estoppel - no issue estoppel arising as result of County Court judge's decision in serious injury application - leave to appeal refused

Hammercall Pty Ltd v Minister for Transport & Main Roads (QCA) - real property - compulsory acquisition of land - refusal of declarations which challenged validity of acquisition of land - appeal dismissed

Tenney v Matthews (SASC) - contract - joint venture - no breach of settlement agreement - breach of loan agreement - judgment for defendants

Hendrex v Keating (TASSC) - negligence - contract - plaintiff injured in fall from ladder while working on defendants' house - defendants liable

Summaries With Link (Five Minute Read)

Botany Bay City Council v Minister for Local Government [2016] NSWCA 74

Court of Appeal of New South Wales

Bathurst CJ, Beazley P & Ward JA

Judicial review - appellant appealed against primary judge's dismissal of summons seeking declaratory and other relief concerning Government proposal for its merger with Rockdale City Council - Council's primary complaint was that there was to be no consideration in delegate's process of Council's alternative proposal - ss218A, 218B, 218D, 218E, 218F, 220, 263, 745 *Local Government Act 1993* (NSW) - procedural fairness - mandatory relevant considerations - proper construction of s263 - scope of delegate's authority - held: grounds of appeal failed - appeal dismissed.

[Botany Bay](#)

[From Benchmark Tuesday, 19 April 2016]

Murray v Sheldon Commercial Interiors Pty Ltd [2016] NSWCA 77

Court of Appeal of New South Wales

Leeming & Payne JJA; Schmidt J

Negligence - appellant glazier injured in slip and fall from ladder at work at construction site - appellant claimed he slipped because of dust - appellant sued head contractor and occupier of site - primary judge found respondent breached duty of care but causation not established - appellant appealed - ss5B, 5C, 5E *Civil Liability Act 2002* (NSW) - r36.16 *Uniform Civil Procedure Rules 2005* (NSW) - s151Z *Workers Compensation Act 1987* (NSW) - challenges to factual findings - whether dust played role in accident - challenge to finding on causation - duty and breach - contributory negligence - held: challenges to primary judge's decision not made out - appeal dismissed.

[Murray](#)

[From Benchmark Wednesday, 20 April 2016]

Fistar v Riverwood Legion and Community Club Ltd [2016] NSWCA 81

Court of Appeal of New South Wales

Bathurst CJ, Leeming JA & Sackville AJA

Equity - fraud - appellant gave cheque to fraudster who was sole director of company and held herself out as financial adviser who could invest money - most funds provided by appellant dissipated - CEO of respondent club transferred amount from club's bank account to fraudster's company account - fraudster procured bank cheque made out to vendor of property and provided it to appellant's solicitors - solicitors delivered cheque to vendor's representatives - club sued fraudster, fraudster's company, CEO of club and appellant - appeal was against judgment obtained by club against appellant - appellant claimed personal action for money had and received could not be maintained and also challenged findings whether she was recipient of funds and volunteer - whether respondent club could recover against appellant where both were fraudster's victims - whether personal action for money had an received would "outflank" knowing receipt claim under *Barnes v Addy* - held: club's claim turned on whether appellant was a volunteer - appellant did not receive bank cheque as volunteer - appellant by solicitors had received bank cheque as repayment by fraudster's company of existing enforceable debt - appeal allowed.

[Fistar](#)

[From Benchmark Thursday, 21 April 2016]

Palermo Seafoods Pty Ltd v Lunapas Pty Ltd [2016] NSWCA 82

Court of Appeal of New South Wales

Simpson JA; Sackville & Emmett AJJA

Pleadings - leases and tenancies - self-represented litigant - appellant claimed declarations and orders arising out of lease of first respondent's premises - appellant claimed first respondent wrongfully prevented its access to premises - in first judgment primary judge answered certain questions and identified questions not properly addressed, calling for further submissions - in second judgment primary judge found appellant entitled to judgment against second respondent - second judgment was subject of appeal - grounds of appeal related to claim concerning alleged use of and refusal to return its goods - held: primary judge failed to address case which appellant pleaded and presented resulting in substantial wrong or miscarriage of justice - new trial necessary in interests of justice - appeal allowed.

[Palermo](#)

[From Benchmark Thursday, 21 April 2016]

Richtoll Pty Ltd v WW Lawyers (in Liquidation) Pty Ltd [2016] NSWSC 438

Supreme Court of New South Wales

Hoeben CJ at CL

Professional negligence - contract - solicitors' duties - plaintiffs in business of lending money secured by property - plaintiffs were former clients who sued incorporated legal practice for professional negligence and breach of contract in relation to provision of services concerning loans - ss5B, 5D, 5E & 5O *Civil Liability Act 2002* (NSW) - held: plaintiffs made out case for breach of duty/retainer in relation to loan for failure to conduct further ASIC search just before

Benchmark

draw down of loan - no defence established under s5O - however causation not established - judgment for defendant.

[Richtoll](#)

[From Benchmark Friday, 22 April 2016]

Laratae v Dean's Pty Ltd [2016] VSCA 71

Court of Appeal of Victoria

Warren CJ; Tate & Beach JJA

Accident compensation - issue estoppel - worker brought proceedings for compensation for injury - Magistrate held respondent employer was estopped from contesting injury alleged by worker on basis of an issue estoppel arising as result of decision of County Court judge in application for leave to bring damages proceedings under s134AB(16)(b) *Accident Compensation Act 1985* (Vic) - primary judge held there was no issue estoppel because decision in serious injury application was not final - applicant sought to appeal - held: applicant's contention that County Court judge's finding on causation gave rise to issue estoppel was without substance - proposed appeal; had no prospect of success - leave to appeal refused.

[Laratae](#)

[From Benchmark Wednesday, 20 April 2016]

Hammercall Pty Ltd v Minister for Transport & Main Roads [2016] QCA 95

Court of Appeal of Queensland

M McMurdo P; Fraser & Mullins JJ

Real property - compulsory acquisition of land - Court refused appellant's application for declarations which challenged validity of acquisition of its land - ss7, 7(3)(e)(ii), 7(3)(e)(iii), 8(2), 8(2A), 9(1), 9(5), 9(5)(a), 20(1)(a), 20(3) & 36B(2) *Acquisition of Land Act 1967* (Qld) - ss24(1), 24(3), 24(4), 25(1), 25(2), 25(3), 25(8) & s25(12) *Transport Planning and Coordination Act 1994* (Qld) - whether failure to consider material - whether objections not heard by validly appointed or proper hearing officer - whether denial of procedural fairness - whether non-compliance with ss8(2) & 8(2A) *Acquisition of Land Act* - held: appellant did not succeed in grounds of appeal - appeal dismissed.

[Hammercall](#)

[From Benchmark Tuesday, 19 April 2016]

Tenney v Matthews [2016] SASC 34

Supreme Court of South Australia

Bampton J

Contract - joint venture - plaintiff and defendants were joint venturers - following mediation parties executed agreements settling matters in dispute and separating interests - plaintiff alleged breaches of settlement agreement seeking damages from defendants - defendants denied breach of settlement agreement and counterclaimed concerning alleged breaches of vendor loan agreement - defendants sought damages in amount of loan and enforcement of

security over plaintiffs mining lease - ss6, 9, 9AA, 20, 21, 22, 26, 34, 35, 39, 73A & 73B *Mining Act 1971* (SA) - regs12 & 29 *Mining Regulations 2012* (SA) - held: no breach of settlement agreement - defendants established breach of loan agreement - defendants entitled to damages - judgment for defendants.

[Tenney](#)

[From Benchmark Friday, 22 April 2016]

Hendrex v Keating [2016] TASSC 20

Supreme Court of Tasmania

Blow CJ

Negligence - contract - damages - defendants were married and living together in house - defendant husband arranged for removal and replacement of roof cladding and for friends to help - plaintiff was one of the friends - defendant arranged to pay plaintiff for his work - defendant set up ladder for workers to use to travel to and from roof via roof of carport - plaintiff injured when he fell from ladder - plaintiff sued for negligence, breach of contract and breach of statutory duties under *Workplace Health and Safety Act 1995* (Tas) and *Workplace Health and Safety Regulations 1998* (Tas) - ss11 & 12(a) *Civil Liability Act 2002* (Tas) - held: claim for breach of statutory duties failed - defendants breached duty to take reasonable care to protect plaintiff from harm - damages reduced by 60% for contributory negligence - judgment for plaintiff in sum of \$1,126,904.

[Hendrex](#)

[From Benchmark Thursday, 21 April 2016]



Benchmark

The Late Worm

By Kay Ryan

The worms
which had been
thick are thin
upon the ground
now that it's gotten
later. They stick
against the path,
their pink chapped
and their inching
labored. It's a
matter of moisture
isn't it? Time, a
measure of wet,
shrinking, the
drier you get.

[Kay Ryan](#)

[Click Here to access our Benchmark Search Engine](#)