

Monday, 2 February 2015

Insurance, Banking, Construction & Government

A Daily Bulletin listing Decisions of Superior Courts of Australia

 Follow @Benchmark_Legal

Search Engine

[Click here](#) to access our search engine facility to search legal issues, case names, courts and judges. Simply type in a keyword or phrase and all relevant cases that we have reported in Benchmark since its inception in June 2007 will be available with links to each case.

Executive Summary (1 minute read)

Taras Nominees Pty Ltd as Trustee for the Burnley Street Trust v Commissioner of Taxation (FCAFC) - capital gains tax - transfer of land by trust deed and joint venture was taxable disposal - appeal dismissed (B C G)

Zheng v Wallace (NSWSC) - motor vehicle collision - injured driver failed to give way - driver of oncoming prime mover failed to sound horn - driver of prime mover liable - contributory negligence 80% (I)

Naumovski v Naumovski(NSWSC) - real property - arguable case for proprietary interest in property - extension of operation of caveat (B)

Gluyas v Canby (VSC) - defamation - undefended trial - internet publications - damages (I)

Green and Carter In Their Capacities as Joint Executors of the Estate of the late Nancarrow v Nanacarrow(WASC) - wills - interpretation of testatrix's will - mutually exclusive bequests of interest in lot - directions (B)

Wilson v Ferguson (WASC) - equity - breach of confidence by publication of explicit images of ex-partner - injunction - compensation (I)

Zabic v Alcan Gove Pty Ltd (NTSC) - negligence - mesothelioma caused by exposure to asbestos - employer negligent - claim statute-barred (I)

Summaries with links (5 minute read)

Taras Nominees Pty Ltd as Trustee for the Burnley Street Trust v Commissioner of Taxation [2015] FCAFC 4

Full Court of the Federal Court of Australia

Perram, Robertson & Pagone JJ

Taxation - capital gains tax - appellant owner of land entered joint venture agreement with neighbours to rezone and develop land - appellant transferred title to land by deed to company to act as trustee of land and nominee of joint venture - primary judge upheld Commissioner's assessment decision that taxable disposal occurred when appellant entered trust deed and joint venture - Part 3-1 *Income Tax Assessment Act 1997* (Cth) - held: transfer of land to trustee was *settlement* of land and not excluded from CGT Event E1 by s104-55(5) because appellant was not sole beneficiary of trust pursuant to which trustee held land - there was change of ownership by transfer of land to trustee - primary judge correct to include amount of development costs in valuation of land for purposes of calculating taxable capital gain - appeal dismissed.

[Taras Nominees Pty Ltd as Trustee for the Burnley Street Trust](#) (B C G)

Zheng v Wallace [2015] NSWSC 3

Supreme Court of New South Wales

Price J

Negligence - motor vehicle accident - contributory negligence - plaintiff driver injured in collision at intersection with prime mover driven by defendant - plaintiff obliged to give way to prime mover - plaintiff claimed driver of prime mover negligent in failing to moderate operation of prime mover after motor vehicle moved into intersection - ss5B, 5C, 5K *Civil Liability Act 2002* (WA) - *Motor Vehicle (Third Party Insurance) Act 1943* (WA) - held: defendant breached duty of care to plaintiff by failing to sound prime mover's horn to alert plaintiff to his oncoming vehicle - reasonable driver in plaintiff's position would not have proceeded onto highway and would have remained at give way line - plaintiff grossly negligent by proceeding onto highway - plaintiff's very high degree of departure from standard of care prime reason for collision - contributory negligence 80% - judgment for plaintiff.

[Zheng](#) (I)

Naumovski v Naumovski [2015] NSWSC 2

Supreme Court of New South Wales

Black J

Real property - caveat - plaintiff sought order that defendant transfer property to her or declaration that defendant held property on trust for her - plaintiff sought extension of operation of caveat - ss74J & 74K *Real Property Act 1900* (NSW) - held: plaintiff's evidence sufficient to establish arguable case for proprietary interest in property by equitable or proprietary estoppel - balance of

convenience favoured extension of caveat - if caveat not extended plaintiff not protected against sale of property - extension of caveat granted.

[Naumovski](#) (B)

Gluyas v Canby [2015] VSC 11

Supreme Court of Victoria

J Forrest J

Defamation - undefended trial - plaintiff alleged defendant defamed him in series of internet blogs - defendant was resident of United States - held: Court satisfied publications made by defendant - imputations defamatory of plaintiff - plaintiff entitled to award of damages to vindicate reputation and standing - evidence established only few people had seen publications but Court conscious there might be grapevine effect - claim for economic loss for 'mental harm' dismissed as it was not raised in statement of claim.

[Gluyas](#) (I)

Green and Carter In Their Capacities as Joint Executors of the Estate of the late Nancarrow v Nancarrow [2015] WASC 18

Supreme Court of Western Australia

Le Miere J

Wills - plaintiffs were executors of estate - defendants were testatrix's children - executors sought directions in respect of interpretation of testatrix's will - clause of will containing mutually exclusive bequests of testatrix's interest in lot - whether, at date of death, settlement under sale contract had been completed - whether option under option deed exercised - testamentary intention - misdescription of property - s45 *Administration Act 1903* (WA) - held: clause of will reflected a valid gift of land which was formerly part of lot to second defendant.

[Green and Carter In Their Capacities as Joint Executors](#) (B)

Wilson v Ferguson [2015] WASC 15

Supreme Court of Western Australia

Mitchell J

Equity - breach of confidence - parties were formerly in romantic relationship - plaintiff alleged defendant posted photographs and video on Facebook depicting explicit images of her as result of her decision to terminate relationship - plaintiff claimed injunction restraining defendant from further publication of photographs and videos and damages - s25(1) *Supreme Court Act 1935* (WA) - O34 r2 & O34 r4 *Rules of the Supreme Court 1971* (WA) - held: Court satisfied publication occurred in breach of equitable obligation of confidence owed by defendant to plaintiff to maintain confidentiality of images - injunction granted prohibiting further publication of images - plaintiff granted equitable compensation including for the humiliation, anxiety and distress which resulted from the publication.

[Wilson](#) (I)



Zabic v Alcan Gove Pty Ltd [2015] NTSC 1

Supreme Court of the Northern Territory

Barr J

Negligence - limitations - plaintiff dying of mesothelioma recently acquired after long latency period - plaintiff claimed damages for employer's negligence - ss44, 44(2) & 44(7)(a) *Limitation Act 1981* (NT) - ss3(1), 52, 189 & 189(1) *Workers Rehabilitation and Compensation Act 1986* (NT) (WRCA) - employer contended plaintiff's action was barred by s52 WRCA and not preserved by 189(1) WRCA because cause of action did not arise before 1 January 1987, the commencement date of s189 - held: Court satisfied plaintiff's mesothelioma caused by unprotected exposure to asbestos dust and fibres during time he worked for employer - Court satisfied plaintiff's mesothelioma caused by negligence of employer - however, damage not sustained until onset of mesothelioma - plaintiff had not suffered damage prior to 1 January 1987 - cause of action in negligence for contracting malignant mesothelioma did not arise before that date - plaintiff's claim for damages against employer after malignant mesothelioma developed was statute-barred and could not succeed.

[Zabic](#) (I)

[Click Here to access our Benchmark Search Engine](#)