Tuesday 1 February 2011

## Benchmark



www.arconolly.com.au

# Insurance Banking & Construction A Daily Bulletin listing Decisions of Superior Courts of Australia

## Search Engine

<u>Click here</u> to access our search engine facility to do a search of particular legal issues, case names, courts and judges. Simply type in a keyword or phrase and all relevant cases that we have reported in Benchmark since its inception in June 2007 will be available with links to each case.

## Executive Summary (1 minute read)

**Leveraged Equities Ltd v Goodridge Contracts** - assignment - construction of margin lending loan & securities agreement - appeals allowed breach of contract by unauthorised sale of applicant's property - damages - mitigation. (B)

La Trobe Capital & Mortgage Corporation Ltd v Hay Property Consultants Pty Ltd - Negligence - measure of damages - causation - land valuation - appeal allowed (I, B)

**Commissioner of Taxation v Clark** - *Income Tax Assessment Act* 1936 (Cth) -continuity of trust estate - appeal dismissed (B)

Copenhagen Reinsurance Company Ltd, in the matter of the application of The Copenhagen Reinsurance Company Ltd - Insurance Act 1973 (Cth) - scheme confirmed. (I)

Munich Reinsurance America Inc, in the matter of Munich Reinsurance America Inc (no 2) - Insurance Act 1973 (Cth) - scheme confirmed. (I)

**Australian Competition & Consumer Commission v Robinson** - *Trade Practices Act* 1974 (Cth) - eBay sales - fire hazard labelling - fines imposed (I)

Primus Telecommunications Pty Ltd v Kooee Communications Pty Ltd - s51A(1)(a) Trade

## Benchmark



www.arconolly.com.au

*Practices Act* 1974 (Cth) - applicable rates of interest in respect of pre-judgment period to be included in a judgment (I, B, C)

**Altain Khuder LLC v IMC Mining Inc & Anor** - International Arbitration Act 1974 (Cth) - recognition & enforcement of foreign arbitral award (I, B, C)

**T & M Buckley Pty Ltd v 57 Moss Rd Pty Ltd** - Building & Construction Industry Payments Act 2004 (Qld) - leave to appeal summary judgment refused - leave to cross-appeal granted (C)

**St Clair v Timtalla Pty Ltd & Anor (No 2)** - Costs - claim for indemnity costs - use of "and/or" in pleadings (I, B,C)

**Applebee v Alsaffar** - Discovery of documents - hospital records as to similar incidents during similar operations (I)

Helmhout v Apostoloff & Ors; Dempsey-Fiddes v Commonwealth of Australia & Anor; Reynders v Commonwealth of Australia & Anor - Personal injuries - whether agent can appear for a corporation - the position of amicus curiae - supply of particulars (I)

K & J Burns Electrical Pty Ltd v GRD Group (NT) Pty Ltd & Anor (NT) Pty Ltd & Anor - Construction Contracts (Security of Payments) Act 2004 (NT) - appeal allowed (C)

## Benchmark



www.arconolly.com.au

### Summaries with links (5 minute read)

### **Tuesday 1 February 2011**

### Leveraged Equities Ltd v Goodridge [2011] FCAFC 3

Full Court of the Federal Court of Australia

Finkelstein, Stone & Jacobson JJ (in Sydney)

Contracts - assignment - construction of margin lending loan & securities agreement - appeals allowed - comprehensive consideration of case law from Australia, New Zealand, the United Kingdom. & United States of America.

**Leveraged Equities** (B)

Goodridge - decision 12 February 2010: see 'Benchmark' I, B & IBC Tuesday 16 February 2010 - banker & customer - contracts - novation - privity - margin lending - loan & security agreement - *Conveyancing Act* 1919 (NSW) - statutory assignment under s12 - whether unconscionable conduct within s12CA or s12CB *Australian Securities & Investments Commission Act* 2001 (Cth) - breach of contract by unauthorised sale of applicant's property - damages - mitigation.

## <u>La Trobe Capital & Mortgage Corporation Limited v Hay Property Consultants Pty Ltd</u> [2011] FCAFC 4

Full Court of the Federal Court of Australia

Finkelstein, Jacobson & Besanko JJ (in Melbourne)

Negligence - measure of damages - causation - respondent negligently valued land for purposes of a loan - loss of a chance - standard of proof - what constitutes opinion evidence - appeal allowed - judgment for appellant in sum of \$259,291.35.

La Trobe Capital & Mortgage Corporation (I, B)

<u>La Trobe Capital & Mortgage Corporation</u> - decision 18 March 2010: see 'Benchmark' I, B & IBC Monday 22 March 2010 - *Trade Practices Act* 1974 (Cth) - whether applicant suffered loss or damage as a result of respondent's breach of s52 & whether this conduct induced it to enter into a loan agreement that it would otherwise not have entered into - application dismissed.

#### Commissioner of Taxation v Clark [2011] FCAFC 5

Full Court of the Federal Court of Australia

Dowsett, Edmonds & Gordon JJ (in Brisbane)

Div 6 of Pt III Income Tax Assessment Act 1936 (Cth) - continuity of trust estate - appeal dismissed.

Clark (B)

## Benchmark



www.arconolly.com.au

<u>Clark</u> - decision 30 November 2009: see 'Benchmark' I & IBC Thursday 3 December 2009 - taxation - trust income - capital gains - Commissioner contending break in continuity - whether taxpayer had established on balance of probabilities that trustee of trust estate acquired shares in Rothwells Limited in 1988 - Trust Deed - Joint Venture Deed - Unit Transfer Deeds - Release & Discharge Deed - detailed consideration of principles & case law.

## Copenhagen Reinsurance Company Ltd, in the matter of the application of The Copenhagen Reinsurance Company Ltd [2011] FCA 23

Federal Court of Australia

Edmonds J (in Sydney)

*Insurance Act* 1973 (Cth) - transfer of general insurance business of Australian branch of foreign insurer to Australian company within same group of companies - application to Court for confirmation of scheme - scheme confirmed.

Copenhagen Reinsurance Company (I)

## Munich Reinsurance America Inc, in the matter of Munich Reinsurance America Inc (no 2) [2011] FCA 9

Federal Court of Australia

Stone J (in Sydney)

*Insurance Act* 1973 (Cth) - scheme for transfer of Australian direct insurance business of Munich Reinsurance America, Inc. to Australian branch of Great Lakes Reinsurance (UK) plc confirmed.

Munich Reinsurance America Inc (I)

### Australian Competition & Consumer Commission v Robinson [2011] FCA 17

Federal Court of Australia

Besanko J (in Adelaide)

*Trade Practices Act* 1974 (Cth) - sentencing of defendant for eight offences under s75AZS(1) where defendant pleaded guilty to eight offences - sleeping bags imported from China sold on eBay did not comply with relevant Australian Standard in relation to fire hazard labelling - fines imposed. Robinson (I)

### Primus Telecommunications Pty Ltd v Kooee Communications Pty Ltd [2011] FCA 8

Federal Court of Australia

Marshall J (in Melbourne)

s51A(1)(a) Trade Practices Act 1974 (Cth) - applicable rates of interest in respect of pre-judgment period to be included in a judgment - rates agreed upon by Discount & Interest Rate

## Benchmark



www.arconolly.com.au

Harmonisation Committee established following a referral by Council of Chief Justices of Australia & New Zealand - misleading & deceptive conduct - reliance - loss & damage - judgment for applicant in sum of \$2,386,349.

Primus Telecommunications (I, B, C)

### Altain Khuder LLC v IMC Mining Inc & Anor [2011] VSC 1

Supreme Court of Victoria

Croft J (in Melbourne)

International Arbitration Act 1974 (Cth) - recognition & enforcement of foreign arbitral award - Mongolia - Convention on the recognition & Enforcement of Foreign Arbitral awards, New York, 1958 - estoppel - second defendant's summons to set aside orders of 20 August 2010 enforcing the award dismissed - detailed examination of case law from the United Kingdom, United States of America, Hong Kong & Singapore.

Altain Khuder LLC v IMC Mining Inc & Anor [2011] VSC 1 (28 January 2011) (I, B, C)

#### T & M Buckley Pty Ltd v 57 Moss Rd Pty Ltd [2010] QCA 381

Court of Appeal of Queensland

Fraser & White JJA; Philippides J

Building & Construction Industry Payments Act 2004 (Qld) - summary judgment had been given in favour of respondent on a part of payment claim in sum of \$19,100.74 - leave to appeal summary judgment sought - leave to appeal refused - leave to cross-appeal granted: summary judgment for respondent in sum of \$77,563 together with interest.

T & M Buckley (C)

### St Clair v Timtalla Pty Ltd & Anor (No 2) [2010] QSC 480

Supreme Court of Queensland

Martin J

Costs - claim for indemnity costs - use of "and/or" in pleadings - whether Statement of Claim alleged defendants to be jointly or jointly & severally liable - whether an offer to settle was made to all defendants - an interesting decision, with detailed examination of case law from Australia, the United Kingdom & United States of America.

St Clair (I, B, C)

<u>St Clair</u>- decision 20 August 2010 - personal injuries - helicopter accident - claim against first defendant dismissed - judgment against fifth defendant (ATA) in sum of \$1,729,566.

## Benchmark



www.arconolly.com.au

### Applebee v Alsaffar [2011] TASSC 1

Supreme Court of Tasmania

Blow J

Discovery of documents - claim of negligence during surgical operation - hospital records as to similar incidents during similar operations - records in question are relevant and discoverable for the purposes of rr386(1) *Supreme Court Rules* 2000 (Tas.)

Applebee (I)

## Helmhout v Apostoloff & Ors; Dempsey-Fiddes v Commonwealth of Australia & Anor; Reynders v Commonwealth of Australia & Anor [2011] ACTSC 2

Supreme Court of the Australian Capital Territory

Refshauge J

Personal injuries - plaintiff alleging administration of capsicum spray - whether agent can appear for a corporation - the position of *amicus curiae* - supply of particulars - CCTV footage - comprehensive consideration of text & case law from Australia & U.K.

Helmhout v Apostolof (I)

## K & J Burns Electrical Pty Ltd v GRD Group (NT) Pty Ltd & Anor (NT) Pty Ltd & Anor [2011] NTCA 1

Court of Appeal of the Northern Territory

Southwood & Kelly JJ; Olsson AJ

Security of payments legislation - *Construction Contracts (Security of Payments) Act* 2004 (NT) - appeal allowed & decision of adjudicator restored - cross-appeal dismissed - extensive consideration of U.K. & Australian case law.

K & J Burns Electrical (C)

<u>GRD Group (NT)</u>- decision 28 June 2010: see 'Benchmark' C & IBC Tuesday 6 July 2010 - payment claims - subcontract - lump sum contract for electrical work - remedial works - late completion - in relation to summary invoice, adjudicator had lacked jurisdiction except for so much of the SI as related to the balance of the retention fund.



www.arconolly.com.au

#### **William Charles Piguenit**

Australian painter

(b. Hobart, Tasmania 1836 - d. Hunters Hill, NSW 1914)

Turner to Monet | W.C. PIGUENIT | The flood in the Darling 1890

- the painting is part of the Art Gallery of NSW collection

**DAAO** William Charles Piguenit

Click Here to access our Benchmark Search Engine